bree 1111 \* BCAD BT 611/5003 10:23:23 BW [Egstem Daylight Time] \* SVB: Use 10:523:30 \* CSID: 16103235414 \* DURATION (mm-28):03-50 \* DURATION (mm-2

# **REMARKS**

## I. Status of the claims

Claims 1-9 were previously canceled. Claims 10-13 and 16-21 are amended in this response; claims 14 and 15 were previously presented. After entering this response, claims 10-21 remain for consideration.

### II. Claim Amendments

Claim 10 is amended by (1) limiting the process to one high pressure tube reactor and (2) changing the pressure range from the original claimed range of "100 to 4000 bar" to "1000 to 4000 bar." Claim 20 is also amended by limiting the apparatus to one tube reactor rather than "at least one tube reactor." These amendments are fully supported by the original disclosure. For instance, the support for the pressure range of 1000 to 4000 bar is found in the paragraph starting at line 20, page 5. As the Figure indicates, the process or the apparatus of the invention uses one tube reactor rather than two. Other minor changes have been made to the amended claims to make these claims more understandable or consistent. No new matter has been introduced by the claim amendments.

# III. Response to the Rejection of Claims 10-21 for Lacking Enablement

The Examiner has rejected claims 10-21 under 35 U.S.C. §112, first paragraph, as failing to comply with the enablement requirement. According to the Examiner, the claims contain the term "re-circulate" while the specification does not teach how "re-circulate" is achieved. Applicants respectfully disagree with the Examiner and ask the Examiner to withdraw the rejection for the reason that follows.

The word "re-circulate" is well explained in English dictionaries. According to Webster's Third New International Dictionary of the English Language, G. & C.

Merriam Company, Springfield, Massachusetts, U.S.A., 1971, "re-circulate" means "to circulate again" (see page 1895), while "circulate" means "to flow" (see page 409). For the convenience of the Examiner's review, Applicants have enclosed in this response a copy of these two pages.

For instance, claim 10 recites "... the unpolymerized ethylene separated off in the high-pressure stage is separated from any remaining monomeric, oligomeric and/or polymeric constituents and is re-circulated to a first inlet of the tube reactor in a high-pressure circuit ..." By "re-circulated," Applicants mean that the unpolymerized ethylene flows back to a first inlet of the tube reactor. The meaning of "re-circulate" is very clear and will be so understood by ordinary skilled artisans in the industry. Furthermore, ordinary artisans in the industry will understand that ethylene, as a gas, flow through pipes under pressure. Therefore, it is not required under the patent law for Applicants to teach how "to re-circulate" ethylene because this technique is well known by ordinary skilled artisans.

# IV. Response to Anticipation/Obviousness Rejection of Claims 20 and 21

The Examiner has rejected claims 20 and 21 under 35 USC § 102(b) as being anticipated by or, in the alternative, under 35 USC § 103(a) as being obvious over Marechal (US 6,355,741).

MPEP § 2131 provides: "A claim is anticipated only if each and every element as set forth in the claim is found, either expressly or inherently described, in a single prior art reference." Verdegaal Bros. v. Union Oil Co. of California, 814 F.2d 628, 631, 2 USPQ2d 1051, 1053 (Fed. Cir. 1987). According to MPEP § 2131.02, "The identical invention must be shown in as complete detail as is contained in the ... claim." Richardson v. Suzuki Motor Co., 868 F.2d 1226, 1236, 9 USPQ2d 1913, 1920 (Fed. Cir. 1989).

To establish a prima facie case of obviousness, three basic criteria must be met. First, there must be some suggestion or motivation, either in the references themselves or in the knowledge generally available to one of ordinary skill in the art, to modify the reference or to combine reference teachings. Second, there must be a reasonable expectation of success. Finally, the prior art reference (or references when combined) must teach or suggest all the claim limitations. The teaching or suggestion to make the claimed combination and the reasonable expectation of success must both be found in the prior art, and not based on applicant's disclosure. In re Vaeck, 947 F.2d 488, 20 USPQ2d 1438 (Fed. Cir. 1991).

As the Examiner recognized, Marechal teaches a loop reactor, while claims 20 and 21 claim a high pressure tube reactor. Thus Marechal cannot anticipate the claims or make the claimed invention obvious because it teaches a different thing from what is claimed here.

Applicants respectfully request that the Examiner withdraw the rejections and allow remaining claims 10-21. Applicants invite the Examiner to telephone their attorney, Shao-Hua Guo, at (610) 359-2455 if a discussion of the application might be helpful.

Respectfully submitted, Andrei Gonioukh et al.

Shao-Hua Guo

Attorney for Applicants

Reg. No. 44 728

Reg. No. 44,728

LyondellBasell Industries Phone: (610) 359-2455

June 1, 2009

Customer Number: 24114

#### TO FIAT (72) 82-E0:(22-mm) NOITARUO : PACE 10/11 \* RCVD AT 6/1/2009 10:53:57 AM [Eastern Daylight Time] \* SVR:USPTO-EFXRF-6/29 \* DNIS:2738300 \* CSID:16/103592414

U.S.A., 1971, "re-circulate" means "to circulate again" (see page 1895), while "circulate" means "to flow" (see page 4(9)). or the English Language, U. & U. Mernam Company, Springfield, Massachusens,

### circuitously

more at cuscuir? 1: being a circular or winding course; incoract, nouthabaour (two bacs possible—the one direct by Mas, the other ~ through Clan—1. Thehand, in one ~ mile through the other ~ through Clan—1. Thehand, in one ~ mile through the business district it (the San Antonio rivers end up less than gold bundred years) from where it sanver devices procedure (~ serious); nut fortfurfalth, direct, or to the point (~ in speech)—through the class from the point (~ in speech)—through the class of the point of the point of a topically Methodist preacher settinged to a circuit exp. on the forties of the control of the point of a topically methodist preacher setting of the control of the point of the control of the contro

circular velocity n : Velocity of CRCLATION of CRCLATION of CRCLATION of CRCLATION of the condition of the c





if. circulations. circulation is circulation in the mammal particulation to determine the continuous and the circulation of the court of the circulation and the circulation of the circ

off-outh Variant meanth provided a manufacture standarding of the stan 16103592414

in rural areas) ~ vi 1 chem, obt ; to subject to continuous redistillation in a closed vessel 2: to cause to move in a circulor circuit; account, nortant (fains ~ the air through the piper) 3: to cause to move in a circuit or circuit; account, nortant (fains ~ the air through the piper) 3: to cause to pass from person to petiton and up. to become widely known; counterpart (this cyclence of vestions of internations of circuits) and the pipers of t

circle
dis-num-cise \( \forall \rightarrow + \forall \rightarrow \) = \( \forall \rightarrow \rightarr

medicine 2; to purify spritually (~ therefore the foreign of your heart, and he no longer stubborn—Daut 10:16 (RSV))
cir-cqua-cir-cq or cir-crum-ci-set (-20(1)) n = 5; one that
cir-com-cir-case (-20(1)) n = 6; one that
cir-case (-20(1)) n = 6;
case (-20(1)) n = 6;
case

giruphmenophageal ring \( \text{inst} \). A subject of circum and \( \text{inst} \) and \( \text{inst} \) are resulting the circumference cap. of a four committee and \( \text{inst} \) are resulting the circumference cap. of a four circumference cap. \( \text{inst} \) are resulting to a form of the circumference, circumference, and \( \text{inst} \) are resulting to a form of the circumference, circumference, and \( \text{inst} \) are resulting to a form of the circumference, circumference, and \( \text{inst} \) are resulting to a form of the first the first that bounds a circular plane surface or the length of this line equal to a times the diameter of the perimeter of a great circle or sphere (from the center to the ~ of the spheriod) by Landris, Bounds is the surface or outer limits of a sphere of pounded body in the measure of the perimeter of a great circle or sphere (from the center to the ~ of the spheriod) by Landris, Bounds (within the ~ of a grain of sand) (that mysterious intellectual magnetism that chiarges the ~ of the ago —1.C.Powys) of circums. Sixthin the context of the context of the context of the context of the circumference of the context of the context

recite

in an arunchair in the phakeshi ~ where the books are ~ Rachel Henning) C; a cleft in a living body; sinut 44; a respension of business or geneadure (as of a legaristive body, court, chool) for a comperatively thorit time; a sun, brief vacablen period (most members of Confress took advantage of the Eastur ~ to back to their home districts — Springlief (Mars.) District (Mars.) D

recess appointment w : an appointment made by a president of the U.S. under his constitutional powers to Illi yearneties when the Senate is not in tenzion subject to later confirmation by the Senate recess bed a : a bed so constructed that it may be folded and stood or hong vertically in a cross or closel when not in use—compare DOOR RED recessed arch w [fr. past part, of \*recess?] : an arch set within another in correspond with splayed jambs of a doorway recesse arraying w [freets?] : histalic engraving a process arch disks to make track for the second hand tracess-sion \text{\text{recess}} \text{\text{\text{\text{the limited}}} in correspond with splayed jambs of a doorway who recesses watch disks to make track for the second hand tracess-sion \text{

manifestation — opposed to dominant; compare atther. I LAW
— re-one-atwo-ly-lawis at — to-cos-sive-mess - winds \n see

\*\*Rooms, live \n = 1 : a locative character or factor & 1 an
organism possessing one or more refeedive characters
recursive & Cooking in a second repricably falling on the first
syllable of a word (as in English words of Old English origin)
or as far from the end of a word as the accountal lability of the
language permit (as in Latin or in some classes of Greek words)
or as far from the end of a word as the accountal lability of the
language permit (as in Latin or in some classes of Greek words)
or some state of the language of

a sourcement that is served up again; Reflach (the crudest clumeiest ~ of an old dreary melodrame ~ Sydrey (Australia) Bull.)

Bull.)

2rbahanjii ~ odj [P, past part, of réchanjier so warm again, ir. ré-re-+ chanjier to warm. Ir. MF chanjer — more at CHAFE;

1; warmed over (chicken ~) 2; worked over ; antanezo (two hundred has are intectly ~ — Notion)

16-Cheat \rain that are interest of the rechard, in the rechard of the couple, in the rechard of the star rechard o

pre-cid-i-va-tion \\_--without \n = [ML recidiration, recidiration fr. recidirats + down. de tool 1: experiment can be paire and a superiment of the patients, peed; repeated a medicary to relarge that or previous condition or mode of behavior & study of ~ in mental patients); peed; repeated is superiment or much of thorough and to over-conduct the patients of much of thorough and to over-conduct the patients of much of thorough and the over-conduct the patients of the patients and much of thorough and the over-conduct the patients are related to recidit and the patients of the patients are related to recidit and the patients of the patients are related to recidit and the patients of the patients and the patients are related to recidit and the patients are related to related the patients are related to fall before the patients are related to relate the patients of the patients are related to fall before the patients of the patients are related to patients and the patients of the patients are related to the patients of the patients of the patients are related to the patients of the patients of the patients of the patients of the patients are related to the patients of the patients of the patients are related to the patients of th

return (no incline an incline and investory proportional reciprocally proportional add : investory proportional reciprocally proportional in investory proportional reciprocal proportion in a proportion cost relationship between the cost in the co

ship) 2: to cause to move in alternate divertions 3: to return in kind or degree 1 respond in like measure to: 2 repay (when the compliancing just poid 16mm - J.G. Conzerus) to possish and sensitive when his advances are not reciproculad—C.B.Shaw) — wil; to make a return for something done, given, meand though in a few days not or to your verses by sending you a few remarks—O.W.Holmer 1913) 2: to move forward and backward alternately up and down—T.M.A.Long) 3: to be equivalent recognitions of the control of the

demaily is obtained on a photographic naterial if the product of content is not a photographic naterial if the product of content is not extent in a position of the first in a first in a first in a position of the first in a fi

TROBERT | Tree (a) to the \ adj [1: recitation, n.] t of, relating to, or having the characteristics of recitation - distinguished

TON-01-500 10:25 EVON: TWO DEPTH AND THE PROPERTY OF THE PROPE

002827317216:01

CONFIDENTIAL

PAGE 1/1 \* RCVD AT 6/1/2009 11:01:36 AM [Eastern Daylight Time] \* SVR:USPTO-EFXRF-4/0 \* DNIS:2738300 \* CSID:16103592414

\* DURATION (mm-ss):03-18